



**South
Cambridgeshire**
District Council

Report to: South Cambridgeshire District
Council Planning Committee

10 November 2021

Lead Officer: Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development

21/01147/LBC – Barns Adjacent To 20 West Green Barrington

Proposal: (Listed Building Consent) Demolition of former stable and play barn

Applicant: M & J Lauterpacht

Key material considerations:

- Heritage Impact

Date of Member site visit: None

Is it a Departure Application: No

Decision due by: 7th May 2021

Application brought to Committee because: The proposal is for the demolition of a Curtilage Listed Building and therefore is to be determined by the Planning Committee.

Presenting officer: Jane Rodens, Principal Planner

Executive Summary

1. This application seeks Listed Building Consent for the demolition of a former stable and play barn.
2. The site is located in the development framework boundary and conservation area of Barrington. To the south east of the site is no.20 West Green (West Green Farmhouse), a Grade II Listed Building, and the barns in question are within the historic curtilage of no.20 and are therefore considered to be curtilage listed.
3. The application is supported by a structural report which shows that the existing barns have some re-useable materials but are largely structurally unsound and would require significant rebuilding to make them habitable. In consultation with the Council's Conservation Officer, officers accept that the demolition of the existing barns can be supported as they are beyond reasonable repair.
4. This application is being referred to Planning Committee as the proposal is for the demolition of a curtilage listed building.
5. There is a full planning permission application that accompanies this Listed Building Consent (21/01147/FUL).
6. The application has therefore been recommended for approval, subject to conditions.

Relevant planning history

7. None

Planning policies

National Guidance

8. National Planning Policy Framework 2021 (NPPF)
National Planning Practice Guidance (NPPG)
National Design Guide (NDG)

South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018

9. HQ/1 Design Principles
NH/14 Heritage Assets

South Cambridgeshire Supplementary Planning Documents (SPD)

10. Listed Buildings SPD - Adopted July 2009
Development Affecting Conservation Areas SPD - Adopted January 2009

Consultation

11. Parish Council - Support, with some concerns.

Barrington Parish Council (BPC) reviewed this application at its meeting on 4th May 2021 and resolved to respond as follows.

BPC is generally in favour of the application which despite its intended scale and mass, includes sensitive and appropriate use of materials within a discrete area of the Barrington Conservation Area.

However, BPC has very serious concerns regarding:

1. Incorrect and misleading information provided in the application regarding access to the site;
2. Potentially severe detrimental impacts of demolition and construction traffic upon the green and the Barrington Conservation Area; and requests
3. A condition restricting site access to mitigate the impacts of demolition and construction traffic upon the green and the Conservation Area.

Access to the Site

The Planning Statement at 7.44 states

“Clearly during construction, there is a possibility that larger vehicles or bulky materials will need to access the site. Should this be the case (and to avoid possible damage to the archway) the applicant also owns a secondary access east of the No. 20 which can be used for this purpose.”

In fact, the applicant has no right to use this secondary access for large vehicles and construction purposes and will likely be committing trespass and a criminal offence if they do so without permission, as the proposed access route crosses Barrington Green.

While the site access may be deemed to be a civil matter, it is the sensitivity of this proposed secondary route through the Conservation Area that is a material consideration.

The proposed “secondary route” as shown on the attached map uses a permitted accessway across the green at one of, if not the most sensitive parts of the Conservation Area. The accessway is particularly narrow serving 3 listed buildings including Newlyn (14 West Green) is Grade II* as well as the bowls club and the cricket and football pavilion. There are two key green public footpaths / bridleways at the top of the accessway that are regularly used by walkers and by horse riders.

Furthermore, the accessway narrows further and actually ends at Newlyn and therefore the proposal appears to envisage a need to cross part of the green itself in order to turn into the site. This would require vehicles to make a wide turn across the grass, avoiding a lamp post. This would be a significant and damaging manoeuvre for large construction vehicles to undertake.

Management of Potential Detrimental Effects

Permitted accessways are a prominent characteristic of the Conservation Area. They have been carefully designed to retain a more informal and rural character, without standard blacktop or kerbstones, and of limited width. This restrained engineering is very important to the character of the green spaces.

BPC has evidence of the detrimental effects of heavy construction vehicles on permitted accessways across the Green within the Conservation Area. Turning onto the accessway and at the entry at the development site (3779/17FL) on Back lane which was allowed under delegated powers, has caused extensive damage at the turning entrance to the site, to the accessway and to the green verges. The following Appendix provides photographic evidence of the unsuitable and unsafe nature of this proposed secondary access. BPC notes that the application has assumed that the secondary access is both available and appropriate. It is neither.

The application has not assessed the potential harm to the environment and to public safety in using this route. It has not considered how to manage such detrimental effects or alternative measures to enable access to the site through the main Archway. The applicant's access through the Archway is the only one that can be permitted and therefore carefully thought-out proposals to protect the archway are required.

Conclusion

BPC requests:

1. That it is made clear by condition that the proposed secondary access for construction traffic through the Conservation Area and across the green is not permitted and is not to be used.
2. That prior to commencement, a Demolition and Construction Access Management Plan is submitted for approval to the LPA, and that BPC shall be consulted on the said Plan.

12. **South Cambridgeshire District Council Conservation Officer:**

Comments received 12 August 2021

These comments follow on from those previously submitted and relate to the revised elevations only.

There are still large areas of glazing on the south and north elevations, but these are now less regimented in placement and have shutters in many places to replicate barn doors. Those on the south elevation will be used to shade the interior of the building. The size of some of the windows have also been scaled down. The roof terrace is now covered over so that the terrace is less noticeable as an open space and forms a more integrated space with the rest of the first floor.

The small scale planting along the southern elevation has been removed from the drawings and this elevation now has a less domestic character.

Taking all of this into consideration, plus those matters raised previously, on balance these applications can now be supported as being of an appropriate design for this location.

Taking the above into account, I consider that the proposal will not adversely affect the character of the Listed Building.

Taking the above into account, I consider that the proposal will preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the conservation area.

The proposals will comply with Local Plan policy NH/14.

With reference to the NPPF and the effect on the significance of the heritage asset, paragraph 195 would apply.

Subject to a condition for the details of the following:

- a) bricks and mortar by way of a sample panel
- b) timber cladding, panels and shutters
- c) window details at 1:20 including reveals
- d) roofing materials
- e) rainwater good

Comments received 10 May 2021

The barns in question are within the historic curtilage of no. 20 West Green (West Green Farmhouse) which dates from 1845 and is grade II listed. The barns are considered to be curtilage listed to the former farmhouse. The range of barns to the south of those in question, Outbuilding to Number 20 West Green Farmhouse, are separately listed at grade II also. The whole site is within the Barrington Conservation Area and similar proposals were submitted for pre-application discussion in 2020.

The structural report shows that the existing barns have some re-useable materials, but that some of them are structurally unsound and others would need a lot of rebuilding to make them habitable. Therefore, provided that the replacement dwelling is appropriate to this site, the demolition of the existing barns can be supported as they are beyond reasonable repair. The salvaging of the materials, as laid out in the Heritage Statement, and where they might be re-used is supported.

The scale of the new dwelling is acceptable. The Heritage Statement shows that the barns have evolved in different directions over their history and the proposed layout reflects that by generally being on brownfield land where barns either are still standing or did so previously. The different forms and scale of the various parts of the house replicates what is still evident or looks to have been in place previously when looking at the historic maps. The different heights of

the elements of the building are acceptable and the new building will remain subservient to the listed farmhouse which has a raised ground floor and therefore high eaves.

The proposed estate fencing, which is very permeable, and the wildflower meadow to the west of the site, and hard landscaping around the perimeter of the building are all acceptable. The small scale planting along the southern elevation looks to be overly domestic and should be removed from the scheme. Agricultural buildings have unfussy lines and practical elevations.

The area of concern is the treatment of the elevations. There are large areas of glazing and the roof terrace do not reflect the agricultural aesthetic that the pre-application response asked for. Some of the rooms have a lot of windows and they are out of scale for a building that is supposed to be of agricultural character. It is noted that the Planning Statement makes reference to the north elevation being more private and therefore a freer, more modern aesthetic being used on this façade, but this is not considered to have been successful in terms of the overall character of the building. The same applies to the large glazed areas on the south elevation and the ridge rooflights. The proposed materials are appropriate to the site and include salvaged bricks for the plinths and slates for the roofs. The cladding is to be new timber as the salvaged boards will be offered to the owner of the listed barn for repairs.

The use of a ground source heat pump and photovoltaic panels for renewable energy is supported for the new dwelling.

Taking the above into account, I consider that the proposal will adversely affect the character of the Listed Building, West Green Farmhouse and Outbuilding to No. 20 West Green Farmhouse by being too domestic in character.

Taking the above into account, I consider that the proposal will not preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the conservation area by the new dwelling being too domestic in character and therefore changing the aesthetic of the site.

The proposals will not comply with Local Plan policy NH/14.

With reference to the NPPF and the effect on the significance of the heritage asset, paragraphs 192 and 193 would apply. Without an appropriate replacement building, the loss of the curtilage buildings would cause minor less than substantial harm to the heritage asset"

13. **South Cambridgeshire District Council Ecology Officer:** The application is acceptable subject to conditions for a Construction Ecological Management Plan and a scheme of biodiversity enhancement.
14. **South Cambridgeshire District Council Contamination Officer:** There is no objection to the application subject to a condition for unexpected contamination to be referred to the Local Planning Authority.

15. **South Cambridgeshire District Council Environmental Health Officer:** There is no objection to the application subject to conditions for the hours of work and a Construction Environmental Management Plan.
16. **South Cambridgeshire District Council Drainage Officer:** There is no objection to the application subject to a prior to commencement condition for a suitable surface water and foul water drainage provision for the proposed development.
17. **Local Highways Authority:** No significant adverse effect upon the Public Highway should result from this proposal, should it gain benefit of Planning Permission
18. **South Cambridgeshire District Council Trees Officer:** No objections to the application subject to a condition for a detailed Arboricultural Method Statement and Tree Protection Strategy.

Representations from members of the public

19. There has been one comments received on this application, which is summarised below, the full comments can be found on the Councils Website.
 - The design of the application is acceptable and will improve the village and the Conservation Area.

The site and its surroundings

20. The site is located in the Development Framework and Conservation Area of Barrington.
21. To the south east of the site is no.20 West Green (Grade II Listed Building) and to the south west of the site is no.20A West Green. To the front of the site (south) is the listed building Outbuilding to no.20 West Green (Grade II Listed Building), beyond which is an area designated as a Protected Village Amenity Area. To the rear of the site (north) is open countryside.
22. Currently on the site are two barns that are in different states of repair, as some elements of the buildings are in a bad condition. The buildings are within the historic curtilage of no.20 West Green (West Green Farmhouse) which dates from 1845 and is grade II listed. The barns are considered to be curtilage listed to the former farmhouse. The range of barns to the south of those subject to this application, Outbuilding to no.20 West Green Farmhouse (Grade II Listed Building), are separately listed as grade II.

The proposal

23. The proposal is for Listed Building Consent for the demolition of former stable and play barn.

Listed Building Assessment

Heritage Impact

24. Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 states that in considering whether to grant listed building consent for any works the local planning authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.
25. Section 72 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 states that special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of that area.
26. The existing barns are within the historic curtilage of no.20 West Green (West Green Farmhouse) which dates from 1845 and is grade II listed. The barns are considered to be curtilage listed to the former farmhouse. The range of barns to the south of those in question, Outbuilding to no.20 West Green Farmhouse, are separately listed at grade II. The whole site is within the Barrington Conservation Area.
27. The proposal relates to the demolition of curtilage listed buildings. The application is supported by a structural report which shows that the existing barns have some re-useable materials, but are largely structurally unsound and would require significant rebuilding to make them habitable.
28. In consultation with the Council's Conservation Officer, officers are satisfied that the buildings are beyond reasonable repair and therefore raise no objection to their demolition.
29. Officers note that the report indicates that the barns have some re-useable materials and support their use in the potential construction of the new dwelling on the site, which is the subject of planning application 21/01147/FUL. Given the historic merits of the buildings and their materials, officers consider it appropriate to impose a condition to secure the salvaging of materials where appropriate.
30. Overall, officers consider the demolition of the curtilage buildings to be acceptable given their current state of repair and that their removal would not detract from the character and appearance of the conservation area of setting of the adjacent listed building, which would be preserved.
31. The proposal is in accordance with Policy NH/14 of the Local Plan and associated guidance.

Other Matters

32. This application is only concerned with the demolition of the curtilage listed buildings, the parallel full planning application is associated with the demolition and the erection of a new dwelling on the site. Therefore, the representations and suggested conditions received which relate to matters of design, ecology, highway safety etc., as noted above, will be considered in detail as part of planning application 21/01147/FUL as secured where appropriate.

Conclusion

33. It is considered that the demolition of the curtilage listed buildings acceptable. It has been confirmed by the Conservation Area that there would be no harm to the Conservation Area and the adjacent Listed Buildings; therefore the application is considered to be acceptable in regards to Policies HQ/1 and NH/14 of the Local Plan and associated guidance.

Recommendation

34. Officers recommend that the Committee Approve the application, subject to the below conditions.

Recommended Conditions

- a) The works hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this consent.

Reason: To comply with the requirements of Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Building & Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (as amended by Section 51 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004).

- b) The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plans as listed on this decision notice.

Plans to be listed:

12 Mach 2021

18759/E/01-01 – Elevation Survey

18759/F/01-01 – Floor Plan Survey

18759/T/01-01 – Topographic Survey

P-DE 101 Demolition Plan with Proposed Plan.

12 October 2021

LIA - Location Plan

Reason: In the interests of good planning and for the avoidance of doubt.

- c) No demolition, hereby permitted, shall be undertaken, until details for the careful salvage and reuse of existing materials have been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority. The works shall be carried out in accordance with the agreed details.

Reason: To ensure the reuse of historic materials wherever possible in accordance with Policy NH/14 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018.

Background Papers

The following list contains links to the documents on the Council's website and / or an indication as to where hard copies can be inspected.

- South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018
- South Cambridgeshire Supplementary Planning Documents (SPDs)
- Planning File References: 21/01146/FUL and 21/01147/LBC.

Report Author:

Jane Rodens – Principal Planner
Telephone Number - 07704 018 433